

REIMAGINING SOCIAL CHANGE



# Recruiter training: Job advertisement development

April 2023

### Glossary of terms (1/2)

- Delivery agent (DA): Professionals working to pick up and deliver packages to end consumers
- Flexi-staffing: Provision of temporary and trained semi-skilled employees (e.g., sales) to large companies
- Growing Livelihood Opportunities for Women (GLOW): Program that aims to increase women's employment, participation, and fair treatment
- **High potential industries:** Industries that have the potential to create a) large number of jobs, b) leverage women's capabilities, and c) align with women's employment needs. Home healthcare, last mile delivery and flexi-staffing have been identified as high potential industries
- Household (HH): Group of persons who normally live together and take their meals from a common kitchen unless the exigencies of work prevent any of them from doing so<sup>1</sup>
- Household with low-income: Households belonging to socioeconomic classes A3 or below under the New Consumer Classification System (NCCS). These households have an average monthly household income of INR 18,000 (USD 240) and below
- Job: Activity performed in exchange for income through wages
- Last mile delivery (LMD): Final leg of a delivery where the parcel is delivered to the end-consumer
- Labour force participation rate (LFPR)<sup>2</sup>: Percentage of 15-59 year-olds that are a) employed, or b) are unemployed but seeking work, or c) have expressed willingness to work
- **Logistics**: Transport and storage of the parcel from the seller to the end-consumer. Roles in the logistics industry include delivery agent, warehouse packer and sorter etc.

<sup>1.</sup> Ministry of Home Affairs: <u>Census terms</u> I 2- PLFS 2017-18; While PLFS 2017-18 defines WPR across all age-groups, we have referred to this as WPR for 15-59 year olds only

### Glossary of terms (2/2)

- New Consumer Classification System (NCCS): Method of classifying consumers by their propensity to spend using two variables – education of the chief wage earner and the number of consumer durables owned by the household from a predefined list
- National Family Health Survey (NFHS): Large-scale, multi-round survey conducted in a representative sample of households throughout India to provide demographic and health database
- Partners: Companies collaborating with GLOW to increase women's recruitment and retention
- **Period Labour Force Survey (PLFS):** Quarterly and annual surveys conducted by Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation (MOSPI) for measurement of key indicators pertaining to employment (e.g., labour force participation) by demographic variables (e.g., urban vs, rural, gender)
- **Self-employed:** A person who a) operates own farm or non-farm enterprise, or b) is engaged independently in a profession or trade, or c) is working in their household/family-run enterprise
- Unemployment rate (UR): (LFPR WPR) / LFPR
- Urban: A settlement with at least 100,000 inhabitants with density of 400 people per sq. km or more, and at least 75% of male working population engaged in non-farm activities<sup>1</sup>
- Women: Unless explicitly mentioned, this refers to women aged 15 and 59 years from households with low income<sup>2</sup> in urban<sup>3</sup> India
- Worker population ratio (WPR)<sup>4</sup>: Percentage of 15-59 year olds that are employed

<sup>1.</sup> Defined as settlements of at least 5,000 inhabitants with density of 400 people per sq. km or more, and at least 75% of male working population engaged in non-farm activities, by Ministry of Home Affairs | 2. Households belonging to A3 to E3 NCCS categories | 3. Population of more than 100,000 based on RBIs definition of urban centers | 4. Source: PLFS 2017-18; While PLFS 2017-18 defines WPR across all age-groups, we have referred to this as WPR for 15-59 year olds only

### **Table of Contents**

### **1** Recruiter training: Job advertisement development

### 2 About FSG and GLOW

Objective of the training is to build skills to create and use job advertisements like an expert recruiter

#### How recruiters use job advertisements **Expert recruiter** Behaviors: Markets the job Includes messages to build trust (e.g., **Standard recruiter** free job) Behaviors: Informs Describes job candidates about jobs attractively (e.g., - Shares detailed job shares more information (e.g., job benefits, adds a location, job timings) **Beginner recruiter** photo of women and - Shares job ad twice per Behaviors: Sells a salary men) mandate - Shares job ad every - Shares basic details (e.g., Outcome: 20-30 payrolls 2 days job name, salary, contact • Outcome: 40-50 payrolls details) - Shares job ad once per mandate • Outcome: 5-10 payrolls

**CCCCCC** Focus of today's training

### We will prioritize job ads for 2 channels in today's training

### **Prioritised channels**

- WhatsApp status
- WhatsApp message

### **Deprioritized channels**

- Job portal (e.g., Apna)
- Field (e.g., posters, standees)
- Facebook

# Activity: What can you add to make this job advertisement better?

Typical WhatsApp message by a standard recruiter

### What can you add to this message?

• XX



Salary: 10,000-12,000 Education: 10th and above Location: New Delhi

Interested candidates plz call me

9823843xxx (Sanjay)

19:02 📈

# Standard recruiters share only 6 details of the job and do not regularly share job advertisements

### Standard recruiter job ad Sample WhatsApp message Informs candidates about jobs Shares detailed job information Name of the job role Urgent hiring for promoter - Salary Salary: 10,000-12,000 Education: 10th and above Contact number and name of the Location: New Delhi recruiter Interested candidates plz call me - Experience/ education Job location 9823843xxx (Sanjay) 19:02 🗸 Job timings Shares job ad twice per mandate

# Expert recruiters add 6 more details and share job advertisements frequently to get more leads

### Expert recruiter job ad

### Markets the job

- Includes 6 more details to describe the job attractively and build trust
  - Free job
  - Request for referrals
  - 1-2 line job description
  - Women can apply
  - Photo of women and men in the job role
  - Benefits (e.g., social security, free meal)
- Shares job advertisements every 2 days

### Sample WhatsApp message



Free job for women and men! Earn INR 11,000 in-hand + PF + ESIC!

Job role: Promoter. Stack shelves and explain products to customers.

Location: Delhi

Qualifications: 10th pass. Freshers can apply.

To apply: call 987342XXXX (Sanjay)

Please share with friends and family

10:08 pm 📈

### Do you have any other suggestions to improve this job ad?

### 3 tools to increase outreach effectiveness

- 1 Add a voice note explaining the job
- 2 Share link to jobs group on WhatsApp
- **3** Use online tools to create messages (e.g., ChatGPT, Google Bard)

### We will discuss these in detail in the following slides

### Add a voice note explaining the job

### 6 tips to use voice notes

- When to use?
  - Hiring for candidates who are not proficient in English or reading
  - Sharing interview tips with the candidate
  - Explaining the job description
- How to create?
  - Create a new status to add a voice note
  - WhatsApp does not allow adding text and voice notes in the same status
  - Write the script before recording the voice note
- What to share?
  - Keep the voice note short (~2 mins)
  - Record audio in the local language
  - Send your contact details with the voice note

### Sample WhatsApp message with voice note



Free job for women and men! Earn INR 11,000 in-hand + PF + ESIC!

Job role: Promoter. Stack shelves and explain products to customers.

Location: Delhi

Qualifications: 10th pass. Freshers can apply.

To apply: call 987342XXXX (Sanjay)

Please share with friends and family



### 2 Share link to jobs group on WhatsApp

### 4 tips to share link to jobs group

- When to use?
  - Repeat mandates in a location (e.g., warehouse)
  - Building a network of candidates
- What to share?
  - Message: Link at the bottom of your message
  - Status: Link as a caption below the picture (to ensure candidates can click and join)

### Sample WhatsApp status with link to jobs group

Free job for women and men! Earn INR 11,000 in-hand + PF + ESIC!

Hiring sorters for warehouse in Uluberia. Sort parcels in a warehouse.

Benefits: Free pick up and drop and 1 free meal daily

Qualifications: 10th pass. Freshers can apply.

Apply now! Call 982892xxxx (Sangeeta). Please share with friends and family.

Ask friends and family to join this group for job updates: <u>link.WhatsApp.web.xyz</u>

### 3 Use online tools to create messages (1/2)

### 4 tips to use online

- When to use?
  - New mandates to improve clarity of message
- How to create?
  - Open ChatGPT or Google Bard and ask it a question
  - Include key details of the job and the size of the message
  - Ask the app to modify as per your requirement (e.g., make the message shorter, add "free transport")

### Sample of ChatGPT question and response

SH

G

- Write a short whatsapp group message to recruit candidates for a warehouse role, including the following details. No emojis.
  - 1. Salary: 12,000
  - 2. Shift: Morning, day
  - 3. Benefits: one free meal
  - 4. Men and women can apply

#### 📢 Job Opportunity: Warehouse Role

- **♦ Salary:** ₹12,000
- Shift: Morning & Day
- Benefits: One free meal included
- Open to: Men and Women

Looking for dedicated individuals to join our warehouse team! If you're interested in this role and meet the requirements, please reach out to [Your Contact Information]. Don't miss this chance to be a part of our growing team!

### Use online tools to create messages (2/2)

### 4 tips to use online

- When to use?
  - New mandates to improve clarity of message
- How to create?
  - Open ChatGPT or Google Bard and ask it a question
  - Include key details of the job and the size of the message
  - Ask the app to modify as per your requirement (e.g., make the message shorter, add "free transport")

### Sample of ChatGPT question and response



### 3 optional details to increase the effectiveness of your job ad

Include details to build trust (e.g., number of openings, number of candidates placed, positive feedback from candidates)

2 Add logos of employers

**3** Use local language in communication

### We will discuss these in detail in the following slides

### Include details to build trust (1/2)

### 5 tips to shares trust-building messages

• When to use?

(1

- Messages to new contacts/ groups
- Hiring for a new location
- What to share?
  - Number of openings
  - Number of candidates placed
  - Positive feedback from candidates placed

### Sample WhatsApp status with trust-building messages





Congratulations to 20 candidates placed in ABC Warehouse.

Contact me if you want a job. Call 9283493xxx (Sanjay).

### What details have you added to build trust with candidates?

### Include details to build trust (2/2)

### 5 tips to shares trust-building messages

• When to use?

1

- Messages to new contacts/ groups
- Hiring for a new location
- What to share?
  - Number of openings
  - Number of candidates placed
  - Positive feedback from candidates placed

### Sample WhatsApp message with trustbuilding messages



Free job for women and men! Earn INR 11,000 in-hand + PF + ESIC!

Hiring sorters for warehouse in Uluberia. Sort parcels in a warehouse. 15 out of 25 openings filled.

Benefits: Free pick up and drop and 1 free meal daily

Qualifications: 10th pass. Freshers can apply.

Apply now! Call 983943xxxx (Sanjay)

Please share with friends and family

### What details have you added to build trust with candidates?

### 2 Add logos of employers

### 2 tips to use company logos

- When to use?
  - Only when a client gives permission
- What to share?
  - Logo along with standard recruitment message

### Sample WhatsApp message with company logo



### 3 Use local language in communication

### 2 tips to use local language

### When to use?

- Creating a new template
- Local language only: Hiring for candidates who are not proficient in English

लड़कियों और लड़कों के लिए फ्री जॉब! कमाइए 11,000 रूपये हाथ मैं + पी एफ + सेहत बीमा!

उलूबेरिअ वेयरहाउस में सॉर्टर के लिए हायरिंग. वेयरहाउस में पार्सेल्स सोरट करें

फायदे: मुफ्त पिक अप और ड्राप. हर दिन एक वक़्त का खाना मुफ्त!

क्वालिफिकेशन: 10th पास, कोई एक्सपीरियंस की ज़रूरत नहीं

अभी अप्लाई करें! कॉल 9999232xx (संगीता)

दोस्तों और परिवार वालों को भी जानकारी दें

11:27 pm

Sample WhatsApp messages in local language

Ladkiyon aur ladkon ke lie free job! Kamaiye 11,000 rupye haath main + PF + ESIC!

Uluberia warehouse mai sorter ke lie hiring. Warehouse mai parcels sort karen

Faayde: Muft pick up aur drop. Harr din ek waqt ka khana muft!

Qualifications: 10th pass, koi experience ki zarurat nahi

Abhi apply karen! Call 98323xxx (Sangeeta)

Doston aur parivar waalon ko bhi jankaari den 11:28 pm 🗸

### Checklist for job advertisements

### **Details to include**

- Name of the job role
- Salary
- Contact number and name of the recruiter
- Experience/ education
- Job location
- Job timings

### 6 more details

- Free job
- Request for referrals
- 1-2 line job description
- Women can apply
- Photo of women and men in the job role
- Benefits (e.g., social security, free meal)

### How to implement?

- Ask the manager for templates
- Keep building new groups, including adding women to groups or making a separate women's group
- Share WhatsApp group links at training institutes or job fairs
- Share job advertisement every 2 days

### We will share the templates with your managers after this training

### What are 1-2 learnings you will implement from today's training?

### **Table of Contents**

### 1 Recruiter training: Job advertisement development

### 2 About FSG and GLOW

# FSG aims to create sustainable impact by demonstrating the profitability of offering inclusive products, services, or practices

Mission	To improve opportunities, agency, and choice for families with low- income by working with companies to serve families as customers (and not with non-profits to serve them as beneficiaries)	
Vision	To demonstrate profitability of offering inclusive products, services, or practices (e.g., housing, education, employment) that benefit families with low-income	
	Run multiyear programs to address barriers that prevent companies from offering inclusive products, services or practices	
	Talk to thousands of families to understand their needs, aspirations, and challenges	
	Talk to hundreds of CXOs and managers to understand their business, ecosystem, regulatory and operational challenges	
Approach	Co-create, pilot and rollout solutions with companies to address barriers and profitably scale inclusive products, services, or practices	
	• <b>Publish and disseminate public goods</b> (e.g., primary research, best practices, business model) to get more companies to offer the product, service or practice	
	Address ecosystem barriers (e.g., policy suggestions) to make the market more conducive	

### GLOW's Vision, Mission and Goals

	Vision	<ul> <li>Improve gender equity in India by economically empowering women</li> </ul>
	Mission	<ul> <li>Sustainably place 1m+ women from households with low- income<sup>1</sup> in jobs by shifting companies' mindset and practices</li> </ul>
Ø	Goals	<ul> <li>In 6 years:</li> <li>Place 100,000 women in jobs across 2-3 high-growth industries</li> <li>Make it easier and less risky for these industries to increase women's workforce participation by publishing best practices and demonstrating the business benefits of employing women</li> </ul>

1 – Households belonging to socioeconomic classes A3 or below under the New Consumer Classification System (NCCS). These households have an average monthly household income of INR 18,000 (USD 240) and below

### 2 of 3 women in urban India come from low-income and loweducation backgrounds





Segment of women GLOW works with

To meaningfully increase women's workforce participation, women from low-income and low-education backgrounds need to be employed

1. Households belonging to socioeconomic classes A3 or below under the New Consumer Classification System (NCCS). These households have an average monthly household income of INR 18,000 (USD 240) and below

# Family and societies restrict women from taking up employment opportunities

### Primary insight

84% of women need to secure permission to work

## Family attitudes are progressive in theory, not in practice

Most families prefer entrepreneurship but, most women prefer jobs

11% of women are willing to use paid day care services

### Supporting insights

- 84% of women need to secure permission prior to deciding to work
  For 1 in 3 women that are neither working nor seeking a job, lack of permission or precedence is the primary reason for not working
- A While >90% decision makers believe it is important for women in society to work and that it brings pride to the family...
- B ...1 in 4 prefer if women in their households did not work at all
- 69% of key decision makers firmly believe that the main role of a woman is to take care of the home and children
- A 3 in 4 decision makers in the family prefer that women work from home or start a business so they can also manage house work
- B 2 of 3 aspiring-to-work women prefer jobs over entrepreneurship
  - 93% women want fixed salaries over daily wages
- A Both women and key decision makers believe child care is primarily the mother's and families responsibility
- B 51% of women are aware of paid day care services, 11% are willing to use services and only 1% have used the services
  - Of the 15% women that cited lack of affordability as a reason for not using paid day-care services, ~50% are willing to use Anganwadi services<sup>1</sup>

Note: Unless explicitly mentioned, 'women' in this document refers to women aged 15 and 59 years from households with low income (i.e. households having an average monthly household income of INR 18,000 or USD 240 and below) in urban India. Data source: FSG's interviews with 6,600 women and 550 key decision makers from urban households with low-income in 16 cities across 14 states in India. 1. Anganwadis are government-run child care and development centers set up under the Integrated Child Development Services Scheme of the Central Government of India. Provision of Anganwadi service is free.

# Despite this, women in urban India want to work in jobs and are confident in their abilities to do these jobs

### **Primary insight**

1 in 2 women in urban India want to work in jobs

#### 0

Women want to work to be self reliant and are confident in their abilities

Some women are willing to work in nontraditional and male dominated workplaces (e.g., warehouses)

### **Supporting insights**

- Women in urban India want to be in jobs; 1 in 2 women are either working in a job or seeking one
- B 88% of women believe a mother could work outside the house
- C Women with children >6 years and those that know other working women are among the most likely to be in a job
- 72% of women strongly believe that they should not prioritize children and household over thinking about working
- A 64% of women strongly agree that for a woman to be self-reliant it is important to work
- B Supporting own and family expenses is the key reason for >90% women to start seeking jobs
- **C** 87% of women are optimistic about their ability to pick up new skills
- A Some segments of women are more amenable to be in a job (e.g., women with low education levels, strong working culture and child >6 years are most willing to work in warehouses)
- 70% believe they would be comfortable talking to strangers (including men)
  - 1 in 2 women are comfortable working in an environment that is 90% male

Note: Unless explicitly mentioned, 'women' in this document refers to women aged 15 and 59 years from households with low income (i.e. households having an average monthly household income of INR 18,000 or USD 240 and below) in urban India. Data source: FSG's interviews with 6,600 women and 550 key decision makers from urban households with low-income in 16 cities across 14 states in India.

# ~1m women can be brought into the workforce by increasing women's participation in high-growth industries from 8% to 24%

### Last-mile delivery



Hyperlocal delivery agent<sup>4</sup>



Last-mile delivery agent

### Warehousing



Warehouse packer



Warehouse sorter<sup>5</sup>

#### **Flexi-staffing**



**Retail sales associate**<sup>6</sup>



Tele calling agent<sup>7</sup> and more...

- High-growth industries (e.g., Last-mile delivery, warehousing, and flexi-staffing) employed ~1.2 million workers in 2020, of which ~8% were women<sup>1</sup>
- Many jobs (e.g., delivery agent, warehouse packer) in these industries need basic education (i.e., 10<sup>th</sup> grade completed) and on-the-job training<sup>2</sup>
- Increasing women's participation from 8% to 24% by 2030 can add 1m+ additional women in jobs<sup>3</sup>

1 – PLFS 2019-20, Indian Staffing Federation Report 2018, 2020 and 2021 | 2 – Based on FSG's interviews with Logistics and Flexi-staffing companies | 3 – Assuming Logistics and Flexi-staffing industries could employ ~3.8 million workers by 2030 | 4-MONEY SHARMA / AFP via Getty Images | 5-Metamorworks/Shutterstock.com | 6- IndianFaces/Shutterstock.com | 7- moodboard/Brand X Pictures via Getty Images

# Barriers preventing companies from increasing women's workforce participation



# Most of these barriers cannot be addressed effectively by firms themselves

#### Firms will not address barriers because...

- Insufficient risk-adjusted return (e.g., lack of data on business benefits of hiring women, cost of research to understand women's needs and preferences when impact on gender diversity is unclear, cost of spending team's time when there is low confidence in returns)
- Availability of lower cost alternatives reduces willingness to try new strategies (e.g., cost of hiring women for delivery agent (DA) roles is 3x that for men)
- Free rider problem creates risks to investments in gender equity (e.g., risk of competitors poaching women from firms that invest in finding and recruiting women)
- **Competitive instinct** reduces willingness to co-operate to solve common issues (e.g., low willingness to cooperate to convince families that field roles are appropriate for women)

#### Firms cannot address barriers because...

- Lack of capacity and capability limit ability to adopt gender-equitable practices (GEPs) (e.g., designing GEPs, sequencing GEPs into a low-risk and low-cost roadmap, inability to invest in infrastructure)
- Lack of networks constrains ability to solve ecosystem issues (e.g., with impact investors, skilling organizations, clients willing to pay more for women)
- Lack of neutrality limits capability to influence stakeholders (e.g., government is less likely to change policy if firm petitions vs. if a neutral party like FSG explains the need to allow women in night shifts)
- **Biases** make it difficult to hire female talent (e.g., Societal biases on role of women or on jobs appropriate for women, five unconscious biases within firms about women's willingness and ability to work)

# As an industry facilitator, GLOW is making it desirable, viable, and feasible for companies to improve gender diversity

GLOW's role	Details
Sign up companies	<ul> <li>Identify, convince and sign-up 18 companies as 'partners'</li> </ul>
2 Increase desirability	<ul> <li>Share data that women (a) want to take up jobs, (b) are comfortable working in an environment that is 90% male, (c) are willing to learn new skills in jobs</li> </ul>
3 Increase viability	<ul> <li>Document and share business benefits of hiring women (e.g., higher accuracy, greater retention)</li> </ul>
4 Increase feasibility	<ul> <li>Create public goods (e.g., roadmap to reduce effort, risk, and cost of implementing gender equitable practices)</li> </ul>
5 Create an enabling support system	<ul> <li>Develop policy suggestions to make it easier and cost-effective to employ women</li> </ul>

# Between 2020 and 2023, GLOW industries have nearly doubled the number of women in jobs from ~105K to ~200K



#### Impact

~94,000 additional women added in jobs in Last-mile delivery, warehouse<sup>1</sup> and flexistaffing industries<sup>2</sup>



1- Logistics: PLFS report 2020,2021,2022 and 2023 | 2-Flexistaffing: Total workforce triangulated from ISF Annual Report- 2021, 2022 and 2023 | 3- Industries considered under Flexi-staffing: Retail, FMCG & FMCD, Logistics & E-Commerce, BFSI and Industrials

# FSG

### REIMAGINING SOCIAL CHANGE

#### Disclaimer

This report has been prepared by FSG solely for the dissemination of information. The reader shall not use this report for any other purpose and in particular, shall not use this report in connections with the business decisions of any third party and advisement purposes.

The report contains analyses that are intended to provide high-level information on the subject and are not an exhaustive treatment of the issues. The analyses in the report are limited by the study conducted, geographies surveyed, the time allocated, information made available to FSG, and are dependent on the assumptions specified in this report.

FSG accepts no responsibility or liability to any party in respect to this report. It is not intended to be relied upon as a basis for any decision and the reader should take decisions only after seeking professional advice and after carrying out their own due diligence procedures, as well as detailed analysis to assist them in making informed decisions. This report is not and should not be construed in any as giving investment advice or any recommendation by FSG to the reader or any other party. The reader shall be solely responsible for any and all decisions (including implications thereof) made by them on the basis of this report. FSG shall not be responsible for any loss whatsoever sustained by any person who relied on this material.



This work, except for the images used in the report, is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution – NonCommecial-ShareaAlike 3.0 Unported License. This copyright allows the copying, distribution, and display of material except for the images – and the ability to make derivative works out of it – if credit is given to the authors, indicating if changes were made, not using the material for commercial purposes and if those derivatives are distributed under a similar agreement.

To view a copy of this license, visit: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/

GENEVA MUMBAI

AI SAN FRANCISCO

SEATTLE